

From: "Coffey, Scott" <CoffeySE@cdmsmith.com>  
To: "Sheldrake, Sean" <sheldrake.sean@epa.gov>  
"Gustavson, Karl" <Gustavson.Karl@epa.gov>  
CC: "Zhen, Davis" <Zhen.Davis@epa.gov>  
"Jones, Jennifer M." <JonesJM@cdmsmith.com>  
"Trump, Julee M." <trumpjm@cdmsmith.com>  
younghs@cdmsmith.com  
Date: 3/6/2018 4:17:21 PM  
Subject: RE: Response to Comments: Fish Tracking FSP -deliberative2

---

I looked into this a little further, the comment edits that Karl had and we updated that weren't conveyed to the Pre-RD Group were pretty minor changes (mostly editorial to the existing comment set). I've attached what Karl sent us on 2-14-18. As a result, **I don't recommend resending the updated comment set at this stage.**

I suggest we could clarify this during the call, but it's their response to Primary Comment #7 that appears to be a poor response and we'll certainly flag this response to discuss with them during the RTC review call on March 15<sup>th</sup>.

Copying Karl's email from the email chain below:

**From:** Gustavson, Karl  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 6, 2018 2:26 PM  
**To:** Sheldrake, Sean <sheldrake.sean@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Response to Comments: Fish Tracking FSP -sf

*Couple things... my edits (sent Wed 2/14/2018 2:29 PM) were not incorporated prior to sending to them. (We did incorporate and sent an updated set to EPA on 2-15-18, but these edits appear to have not been sent to the Pre-RD Group). However, the edits are pretty minor and do not apply to the issue Karl presents below which is focused on Primary Comment #7*

*The responses contend that early May is optimal for catching fish because they are easy to catch by hook and line and "tend to remain near their nest sites and are not expected to move large distances or exit the study area at this time of year."*

*This approach samples the exception (spawning area) rather than the rule (core residency area). These fish should be caught in their "home pool" post-spawning and their movement from there assessed. Sampling pre- or during-spawn fish weakens the study design.*

---

**From:** Sheldrake, Sean [mailto:sheldrake.sean@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 06, 2018 3:57 PM  
**To:** Coffey, Scott <CoffeySE@cdmsmith.com>; Gustavson, Karl <Gustavson.Karl@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Zhen, Davis <Zhen.Davis@epa.gov>; Jones, Jennifer M. <JonesJM@cdmsmith.com>; Trump, Julee M. <trumpjm@cdmsmith.com>; Young, Howard S. <younghs@cdmsmith.com>  
**Subject:** RE: Response to Comments: Fish Tracking FSP -deliberative2

Thanks for clarifying Scott—there may be a version control issue in what Davis conveyed—we might need to convey to preRD the updated comment set Davis? S

Sean Sheldrake RPM, Unit Diver Officer  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Sixth Ave, Suite 900, M/S DOC-01  
Seattle, WA 98101  
206.553.1220 desk  
206.225.6528 cell  
<https://www.epa.gov/diving>

<https://www.facebook.com/EPADivers>

Portland Harbor: <https://cumulis.epa.gov/supercpad/cursites/csitinfo.cfm?id=1002155>

---

**From:** Coffey, Scott [<mailto:CoffeySE@cdmsmith.com>]

**Sent:** Tuesday, March 6, 2018 3:27 PM

**To:** Sheldrake, Sean <[sheldrake.sean@epa.gov](mailto:sheldrake.sean@epa.gov)>; Gustavson, Karl <[Gustavson.Karl@epa.gov](mailto:Gustavson.Karl@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Zhen, Davis <[Zhen.Davis@epa.gov](mailto:Zhen.Davis@epa.gov)>; Jones, Jennifer M. <[JonesJM@cdmsmith.com](mailto:JonesJM@cdmsmith.com)>; Trump, Julee M. <[trumpjm@cdmsmith.com](mailto:trumpjm@cdmsmith.com)>; Young, Howard S. <[younghs@cdmsmith.com](mailto:younghs@cdmsmith.com)>

**Subject:** RE: Response to Comments: Fish Tracking FSP -deliberative

Hi Sean.

We did incorporate Karl's comments, which were received on 2-14-18 and we sent an updated set of Fish Tracking comments back on 2-15-18 (see attached email).

I'm not super clear on this because I wasn't Cc'd, but I believe Davis told me he sent a bulk of EPA comments (including the Fish Tracking) **on 2-13-18** which predates Karl's input. Not sure if this updated set of comments on Fish Tracking went out to the Pre-RD group.

Scott

---

**From:** Sheldrake, Sean [<mailto:sheldrake.sean@epa.gov>]

**Sent:** Tuesday, March 06, 2018 2:28 PM

**To:** Gustavson, Karl <[Gustavson.Karl@epa.gov](mailto:Gustavson.Karl@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Coffey, Scott <[CoffeySE@cdmsmith.com](mailto:CoffeySE@cdmsmith.com)>; Zhen, Davis <[Zhen.Davis@epa.gov](mailto:Zhen.Davis@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Response to Comments: Fish Tracking FSP -deliberative

Karl, Uh oh, we better fix that. Scott, could you tune up our current RTC responses with Karl's input to make sure we're all on the same page, so we get good data?

Thank you.

S

Sean Sheldrake RPM, Unit Diver Officer

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Sixth Ave, Suite 900, M/S DOC-01

Seattle, WA 98101

206.553.1220 desk

206.225.6528 cell

<https://www.epa.gov/diving>

<https://www.facebook.com/EPADivers>

Portland Harbor: <https://cumulis.epa.gov/supercpad/cursites/csitinfo.cfm?id=1002155>

---

**From:** Gustavson, Karl

**Sent:** Tuesday, March 6, 2018 2:26 PM

**To:** Sheldrake, Sean <[sheldrake.sean@epa.gov](mailto:sheldrake.sean@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Response to Comments: Fish Tracking FSP -sf

Couple things... my edits (sent Wed 2/14/2018 2:29 PM) were not incorporated prior to sending to them.

The responses contend that early May is optimal for catching fish because they are easy to catch by hook and line and "tend to remain near their nest sites and are not expected to move large distances or exit the study area at this time of year."

This approach samples the exception (spawning area) rather than the rule (core residency area). These fish should be caught in their “home pool” post-spawning and their movement from there assessed. Sampling pre- or during-spawn fish weakens the study design.

---

**From:** Sheldrake, Sean

**Sent:** Monday, March 05, 2018 11:20 AM

**To:** Alex Liverman ([liverman.alex@deq.state.or.us](mailto:liverman.alex@deq.state.or.us)) <[liverman.alex@deq.state.or.us](mailto:liverman.alex@deq.state.or.us)>; bayuk.dana@deq.state.or.us; brandy.humphreys@grandronde.org; callie@ridolfi.com; Chu, Rebecca <[Chu.Rebecca@epa.gov](mailto:Chu.Rebecca@epa.gov)>; Scott Coffey <[coffeyse@cdmsmith.com](mailto:coffeyse@cdmsmith.com)>; Cora, Lori <[Cora.Lori@epa.gov](mailto:Cora.Lori@epa.gov)>; Courtney Johnson ([courtney@crag.org](mailto:courtney@crag.org)) <[courtney@crag.org](mailto:courtney@crag.org)>; Dan Hafley ([HAFLEY.Dan@deq.state.or.us](mailto:HAFLEY.Dan@deq.state.or.us)) <[HAFLEY.Dan@deq.state.or.us](mailto:HAFLEY.Dan@deq.state.or.us)>; Zhen, Davis <[Zhen.Davis@epa.gov](mailto:Zhen.Davis@epa.gov)>; Deirdre F. Donahue ([deirdre.donahue@sol.doi.gov](mailto:deirdre.donahue@sol.doi.gov)) <[deirdre.donahue@sol.doi.gov](mailto:deirdre.donahue@sol.doi.gov)>; dexb@yakamafish-nsn.gov; Ebright, Stephanie <[EBRIGHT.STEPHANIE@EPA.GOV](mailto:EBRIGHT.STEPHANIE@EPA.GOV)>; DeMaria, Eva <[DeMaria.Eva@epa.gov](mailto:DeMaria.Eva@epa.gov)>; Gail Fricano ([gfricano@indecon.com](mailto:gfricano@indecon.com)) <[gfricano@indecon.com](mailto:gfricano@indecon.com)>; Genevieve Angle - NOAA-NMFS ([Genevieve.Angle@noaa.gov](mailto:Genevieve.Angle@noaa.gov)) <[Genevieve.Angle@noaa.gov](mailto:Genevieve.Angle@noaa.gov)>; Gustavson, Karl <[Gustavson.Karl@epa.gov](mailto:Gustavson.Karl@epa.gov)>; Holly Partridge ([Holly.Partridge@grandronde.org](mailto:Holly.Partridge@grandronde.org)) <[Holly.Partridge@grandronde.org](mailto:Holly.Partridge@grandronde.org)>; Jen Graham <[jennifer.graham@ctwsbnr.org](mailto:jennifer.graham@ctwsbnr.org)>; Jeremy\_Buck@fws.gov; Joe Pitt ([joepitt@ctuir.org](mailto:joepitt@ctuir.org)) <[joepitt@ctuir.org](mailto:joepitt@ctuir.org)>; Josh Newton ([jn@karnopp.com](mailto:jn@karnopp.com)) <[jn@karnopp.com](mailto:jn@karnopp.com)>; jweis@hk-law.com; Kevin Parrett <[Parrett.Kevin@deq.state.or.us](mailto:Parrett.Kevin@deq.state.or.us)>; Knudsen, Laura <[Knudsen.Laura@epa.gov](mailto:Knudsen.Laura@epa.gov)>; Kristin Callahan <[kristin@ridolfi.com](mailto:kristin@ridolfi.com)>; Peterson, Lance <[peterstone@cdmsmith.com](mailto:peterstone@cdmsmith.com)>; Laura Klasner Shira <[shil@yakamafish-nsn.gov](mailto:shil@yakamafish-nsn.gov)>; Madi Novak ([novak.madi@deq.state.or.us](mailto:novak.madi@deq.state.or.us)) <[novak.madi@deq.state.or.us](mailto:novak.madi@deq.state.or.us)>; Mairs, Stephanie <[Mairs.Stephanie@epa.gov](mailto:Mairs.Stephanie@epa.gov)>; Matt Johnson - JD Law Umatilla rep. ([MatthewJohnson@ctuir.org](mailto:MatthewJohnson@ctuir.org)) <[MatthewJohnson@ctuir.org](mailto:MatthewJohnson@ctuir.org)>; mcclincy.matt@deq.state.or.us; tosm@yakamafish-nsn.gov; Michael.karnosh@grandronde.org; Michel L. Wigney ([MLW@karnopp.com](mailto:MLW@karnopp.com)) <[MLW@karnopp.com](mailto:MLW@karnopp.com)>; NaomiStacy@ctuir.org; Rachel DelVecchio ([rdelvecchio@indecon.com](mailto:rdelvecchio@indecon.com)) <[rdelvecchio@indecon.com](mailto:rdelvecchio@indecon.com)>; Rita Cabral ([rcabral@indecon.com](mailto:rcabral@indecon.com)) <[rcabral@indecon.com](mailto:rcabral@indecon.com)>; Robert Brunoe ([robert.brunoe@ctwsbnr.org](mailto:robert.brunoe@ctwsbnr.org)) <[robert.brunoe@ctwsbnr.org](mailto:robert.brunoe@ctwsbnr.org)>; Robert.Neely@noaa.gov; rose@yakamafish-nsn.gov; Sarah Greenfield ([Greenfield.Sarah@deq.state.or.us](mailto:Greenfield.Sarah@deq.state.or.us)) <[Greenfield.Sarah@deq.state.or.us](mailto:Greenfield.Sarah@deq.state.or.us)>; Sheldrake, Sean <[sheldrake.sean@epa.gov](mailto:sheldrake.sean@epa.gov)>; Skadowski, Suzanne <[Skadowski.Suzanne@epa.gov](mailto:Skadowski.Suzanne@epa.gov)>; Buerger, Ted <[ted\\_buerger@fws.gov](mailto:ted_buerger@fws.gov)>; tomd@ctsi.nsn.us  
**Subject:** FW: Response to Comments: Fish Tracking FSP -sf

Hello everyone, please see the attached RTC from the preRD group.

Karl, please let me know asap if you see anything that concerns you, particularly regarding primary comment #1. My first reaction is that the tag drags are responsive to our QA/QC comment, but having worked on usbl and lbl arrays before, I think a month is too long to find out the array was improperly deployed, or that things worked well at peak battery strength during the tag drags, but not so well as the batteries faded (the first month will be a test of whether other mechanical issues are working properly—were any deployed in areas prone to vessel strikes? High levels of prop wash?). I'd suggest we shorten the first download duration to 14 days so we can evaluate whether their live data is tracking correctly, troubleshoot battery issues, and the like. Let me know if you can offline.

Thank you.

S

Sean Sheldrake RPM, Unit Diver Officer  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Sixth Ave, Suite 900, M/S DOC-01  
Seattle, WA 98101  
206.553.1220 desk  
206.225.6528 cell

<https://www.epa.gov/diving>

<https://www.facebook.com/EPADivers>

Portland Harbor: <https://cumulis.epa.gov/supercpad/cursites/csinfo.cfm?id=1002155>

---

**From:** Zhen, Davis  
**Sent:** Monday, March 5, 2018 7:21 AM  
**To:** Sheldrake, Sean <[sheldrake.sean@epa.gov](mailto:sheldrake.sean@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Fwd: Response to Comments: Fish Tracking FSP

Thanks,

Sent from my iPhone, please excuse typos

\*\*\*\*\*

Davis Zhen, Manager  
Environmental Cleanup Unit 2  
Office of Environmental Cleanup  
[1200 Sixth Avenue Suite 900](#)  
M/S ECL – 122, [Seattle, WA 98101](#)  
Tel: [\(206\) 553-7660](tel:(206)553-7660)  
Cell: [\(206\) 437-5826](tel:(206)437-5826)

\*\*\*\*\*

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Tyrrell, Ken" <[ken.tyrrell@aecom.com](mailto:ken.tyrrell@aecom.com)>  
**Date:** March 2, 2018 at 4:45:06 PM PST  
**To:** "Zhen, Davis" <[Zhen.Davis@epa.gov](mailto:Zhen.Davis@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** "Coffey, Scott" <[CoffeySE@cdmsmith.com](mailto:CoffeySE@cdmsmith.com)>, "Young, Howard S." <[younghs@cdmsmith.com](mailto:younghs@cdmsmith.com)>  
**Subject:** Response to Comments: Fish Tracking FSP

Davis,

Attached are the Response to Comments (RTC) for the Fish Tracking FSP.

As we discussed today, we are on track for a technical call on March 15 at a time to be determined.

Scott Coffey and Howard Young are copied to facilitate transmittal.

**Ken Tyrrell**  
Executive Vice President  
Project Coordinator – Portland Harbor  
Design and Consulting Services Group  
M (b) (6)  
[ken.tyrrell@aecom.com](mailto:ken.tyrrell@aecom.com)  
**AECOM**  
1111 Third Avenue  
Seattle, WA 98101  
T +206-438-2700  
[www.aecom.com](http://www.aecom.com)